

MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 25, 2015

President Lee Bollinger, the chair, called the Senate to order shortly after 1:15 pm in the Davis Auditorium of Schapiro Engineering (CEPSR). Fifty-five of 91 senators were present during the meeting.

Minutes and agenda. The minutes of May 1, 2015 and the agenda were adopted as distributed.

President's remarks

World Leaders Forum. The president said the Forum is a vital part of the excitement of a new year on campus, with major speakers such as Chilean president Michelle Bachelet as well as Sheikh Hasina, the prime minister of Bangladesh. He added that the Columbia doesn't always have to ask prominent speakers to address the World Leaders Forum anymore; they sometimes ask to do it.

Columbia Global Reports. The president had recently announced a new initiative to be led by former Journalism School dean Nicholas Lemann. The idea is that the institution of the press, primarily because of financial constraints, is unable to cover important issues around the world, especially those relating to globalization, and that a great university, especially one with a great journalism school, should attempt to fill that void and help people understand the world in a broader way. Dean Lemann has produced three long-form, novella-length reports, on issues that reveal key insights into the processes of globalization. So Columbia has become a member of the press, the president said.

Manhattanville. The president said the opening of the new campus is near--a historic moment for Columbia. This campus will unfold over four or five decades, probably longer. The first buildings will be the Zuckerman Mind Brain Behavior Institute, the Lenfest Center for the Arts, and then the Forum Building, which will provide meeting space on campus, including a 430-seat auditorium and spaces for smaller meetings. The next two buildings are what the president called the Global Center (still in the early planning stages) and the new complex for the Business School, which has nearly completed its fundraising.

These five buildings will mark the main quadrangle or square of the new campus. Three existing Manhattanville buildings--Studebaker, Prentis, and Nash--will be preserved and maintained. Hundreds of Columbia employees are already working in Manhattanville, new restaurants are opening up, and the waterfront has been redone by the City. Extensive efforts have been made to work with people in the Harlem and Upper Manhattan communities, to make this a more open, interconnected campus.

Fundraising. The president said several Columbia schools are gearing up for a new fundraising campaign. He expressed confidence that Columbia will again be in the top five private institutions in actual dollars raised in the past year. The Columbia endowment has also performed superbly over the past decade, near or at the very top among American institutions with endowments larger than \$1 billion.

Since he came to Columbia, the president said, he has considered space and added resources the two critical components to enable the university to reach its potential, and now it is making headway on both fronts.

Remarks from Executive Committee chair Sharyn O'Halloran (Ten., SIPA). Sen. O'Halloran welcomed the Senate to the new year, and addressed the following topics.

1. *Actions under summer powers.* Sen. O'Halloran reported on two uses of the Executive Committee's summer powers on behalf of the Senate.

--To approve President Bollinger's late revisions to the preamble to the proposed Rules of University Conduct, which the Senate adopted on May 1 and which were now before the Trustees for final approval.

--To approve a revised change of name for the School of Continuing Education. In an April 2011 resolution the Senate had approved changing the name to School of Professional and Cross-disciplinary Studies. In the summer of 2015 the Executive Committee approved an amendment to drop the words "and Cross-disciplinary Studies" as no longer suited to the market. This revision will also come to the Trustees for final approval in October.

2. *Student Quality of Life Survey.* Prompted by Sen. O'Halloran, Student Affairs Committee chair Marc Heinrich (CC) was pleased to report that the QoL survey circulated last spring had more than 10,000 respondents--the strongest response ever to a student survey at Columbia, as far as he knew. SAC was now analyzing the results and developing policy recommendations, and hoped to release the results in the first half of October. He expressed thanks for support students had received from the provost's office and others.

New Rules of Conduct. Prompted by Sen. O'Halloran, last year's Rules Committee chair, Christopher Riano (Nonsen, NT, SCE) said that if the Trustees concur in the revisions to the Rules approved by the Senate in May, the committee will move on to the implementation process for new Rules. It will also take up some questions from last year that need more discussion. He expected that Sen. Angela Nelson (Research Officers), an active member of the committee last year, would take over the chairmanship.

AAU Campus Climate Survey. Sen. O'Halloran said EVP for University Life Suzanne Goldberg, who was now also appointed a University Senator by the president, would give a detailed update on the Campus Climate survey at the next plenary. Sen. O'Halloran said a new working group, in addition to the Presidential Advisory Committee on Sexual Assault, will focus on best practices in sexual assault policy.

Senate Diversity Commission. Sen. O'Halloran said the Executive Committee had established a diversity commission, which would function much like the Commission on the Status of Women, first formed in the early 1970s. She introduced the Diversity Commission's faculty co-chair, Sen. Shantanu Lal (NT, CDM), and its student co-chair, Jillian Ross (Stu., SEAS/Undergrad).

Sen. Lal said the commission is mandated to bring students, faculty, and administrators together to consider diversity in its broadest senses, including race, ethnicity, religion, caste, class, society, and sexual orientation, focusing on the role of diversity in the life of the University. Student interests will play a central role in the work of the Commission, Sen. Lal said, but attention will also be paid to issues of particular importance to faculty and other officers. Sen. Lal called senators' attention to a panel discussion of diversity in higher education to be moderated by the provost on Tuesday, October 13.

Sen. Ross looked forward to working on initiatives to build on the current commitment to diversity at Columbia, which was one of two Ivy League institutions to receive the 2015 Higher Education Excellence in Diversity Award.

Sen. Daniel Savin (Research Officers) noted that the roster of the Diversity Commission was significantly less diverse than that of the Commission on the Status of Women. The Diversity Commission has no research officers, or other non-instructional officers besides senior administrators. He said the Senate's research officer constituency, including its 1,000 postdocs, is more diverse than the faculty. He urged the Diversity Commission to add representatives from the ranks of non-instructional officers that are represented on the Commission on the Status of Women.

Sen. Ross thanked Sen. Savin for the suggestion and promised to follow up.

Faculty quality-of-service survey. Sen. O'Halloran said a new Senate survey was in preparation to assess faculty quality of life. It is based on the successful instrument that MIT used a few years ago, which led to reforms that some consider revolutionary. She said the new survey, for full-time Columbia faculty and research officers, would be launched in mid-October. She thanked people who had already commented on the survey draft, and she asked colleagues to encourage constituents to take part.

Introduction of new and returning senators. Elections Commission chair Samuel Roth (Nonsen, Stu., Law) read aloud the names of the following new and returning senators:

Anne Armstrong-Coben (NT, P&S), Erica Avrami (NT, SW), David Bickers (Ten., P&S), Saskia Chanoine (Stu., Bus.), Kunal Chaudhary (Research Officers/Postdocs), Andrea Crow (Stu., GSAS/Hum), William Gaudelli (Fac., TC), Suzanne Goldberg (Admin.), Alice Heicklen (NT, A&S/NS), Sharon Liebowitz (Alum.), Nancy Loiacono (Research Officers), Austin Long (NT, SIPA), John McGuckin (Fac., UTS), Mary Munding (Ten., Nursing), Tatev Papikyan (Stu., TC), Peter Platt (Fac., Barnard), Robert Pollack (Ten., A&S/NS), Brennan Rhodes-Bratton (Stu., PH), Cameron Robertson (Stu., GSAPP), Sean Ryan (Stu., CC), Mary Sormanti (NT, SW), Hariharan Sriram (Stu., SIPA), Fred Ssewamala (Ten., SW), Ann Thornton (Admin.), Janie Weiss (Admin. Staff, CUMC), and Mark Logan Wright (Stu., Law).

Mr. Roth welcomed the group to the Senate.

Election of the Executive Committee and approval of the Standing Committee Roster. Without discussion the Senate approved the list of nominees to the Executive Committee that the

faculty and student caucuses had submitted, and it approved the Standing Committee Roster for the current year.

Honors and Prizes Committee appeal for nominations. Sen. Debra Wolgemuth (Ten., P&S), chair of Honors and Prizes, asked senators to nominate candidates for honorary degrees at Commencement. She said there will be an announcement from the Secretary's office, and abundant information about the nomination process is available at the Secretary's website. Nominations can be submitted either to the Senate office or the Secretary's office. The categories are the Arts, Humanities, Natural and Applied Sciences, and Public Life and Government. Nominations are due at the end of the fall, but are often accepted early in the coming spring semester. The committee works hard to pick excellent candidates from these nominations, along with the president.

Introduction of some new members of the administration.

Christopher Brown, Vice-Provost for Faculty Affairs. Prof. Brown said he had been at Columbia for eight years, mostly as a history professor, but he recently succeeded Stephen Rittenberg as in vice provost position. Previously he had been a professor at Rutgers and NYU, and had taught at Johns Hopkins and William and Mary. His own work has focused on British imperial history, the American Revolution, and the history of the Atlantic slave trade. He will remain a full-time rank-and-file faculty member while serving as an administrator. He said it is a good step to have full-time faculty who are also senior administrators—if he can pull it off.

For the last three years, Prof. Brown said, he has served on the Tenure Review Advisory Committee (TRAC), which reviews all tenure cases that come through the University except for those in the Law School. During that time he has reviewed more than 150 tenure cases. The office he now leads oversees the tenure process, and is responsible for ensuring the excellence of the university's academic mission for the next generation. His office also manages all faculty appointments at Columbia, and is responsible for most issues related to the faculty experience, including retirement.

His office is now taking a growing interest in faculty and researchers who are not tenured, but are full-time employees vital to the teaching and research mission of the University. He said the policies and practices governing the experience of these officers deserve the same oversight and guidance that tenure-track and tenured faculty receive.

The updated pipeline report from the Commission on the Status of Women. Prof. Brown said he had given a lot of thought to what he considered an excellent report. Much of the response to its call for plugging the leaks in the academic pipeline for women will come from new and renewed efforts in hiring and mentoring practices throughout the university. The provost's office has work to do on the University's assistance with child care and schooling. It will look again at the question of salary equity to make sure there are no discrepancies affecting women across the University. A matter of particular concern is the number of women who come into Columbia as tenure-track faculty but end up leaving before they even come up for tenure. Not enough is known about why these women leave early. One problem is that there are real shortcomings with the information the university gathers and with the form in which it is gathered. But there's also not enough qualitative knowledge about individual reckonings. Is it a

matter of the climate? The amount of support for research? The pressures of the tenure bid? This year the provost's office will devise strategies for getting answers to these questions, with the goal of targeting resources in a way that will enable the university to make sure it keeps the faculty it wants to keep.

Ann Thornton, University Librarian and Vice Provost for Information Services. Dr. Thornton gave a report that was closely based on a PowerPoint presentation that had been distributed.

Annual committee reports.

Campus Planning and Physical Development. Committee chair Ron Breslow (Ten., A&S/NS) gave a report that highlighted the main points in his written annual report, which had been distributed.

Research Officers. Committee chair Daniel Savin, Senior Research Scientist in the Astrophysics Laboratory, gave a report closely based on the written report that had been distributed, as well as on a count of Senate constituencies that the Senate office had prepared for him.

External Relations. Committee chair Howard Worman (Ten., P&S) gave a report closely based on the written report that had been distributed.

Sen. Worman added one new point, mentioning an article in that day's Spectator offering a more optimistic picture of Columbia's research funding prospects in the near future than the one the committee had been seeing in its discussions during the last two years.

Sen. Ian Lipkin (Ten., Public Health), speaking from his vantage point as a member of committee advising the director of NIH, said the most successful grant applications are no longer coming from individual researchers for their own research projects, but for larger programs involving cancer or precision medicine or neuroscience or the microbiome, programs that use many investigators, often across an institution.

Sen. Lipkin also spoke to a point Sen. Savin had made in his report for the Research Officers Committee about the need for funding sources within the University to support investigators' university activities that are not covered by their federal grants, including the writing of grant applications. Sen. Lipkin said this is a problem not just for research officers but for all faculty engaged in research. The university must find a way to subsidize these non-grant-related activities, either through indirect costs or endowments or something else.

Other reports.

Advisory Committee on Socially Responsible Investing. ACSRI chair Jeffrey Gordon recalled his last visit to the Senate on April 3 to discuss an ACSRI proposal to divest from private prisons. He said the basis of the proposal was the committee's sense of the incongruity between the university's core values and the business case of private prisons, which requires an increasing rate of imprisonment--a rate that is already high by historical and cross-national standards. The Trustees accepted the ACSRI recommendation, but on somewhat different

grounds, focusing on mass imprisonment as a social phenomenon. But Sen. Gordon thought the detailed deliberations of the committee helped the Trustees reach their conclusions.

Sen. Gordon said an ACSRI subcommittee on fossil fuels also worked last year on a student petition calling for divestment from firms that extract fossil fuels. A faculty letter calling for fossil-fuels divestment with many signatures also came to the committee [and elicited extensive discussion at the Senate on April 3], and the subcommittee met with the student petitioners numerous times.

Toward the end of the last academic year, the ACSRI came to adopt a proposal it calls Stand Up for Science that was designed to provide a basis for the University to take a consistent position on this contested public issue, through its endowment investment policy. Climate change is different from apartheid or even private prisons, the argument goes, because the core science remains contested. The sense of the ACSRI is that climate change science “denialism” has played a critical role in public policy debates in this area. If you’re standing on a railroad track and the train is coming, action inevitably follows when you turn your head and see the train. The critical question is how to get the main political actors to accept the reality of the onrushing train.

Sen. Gordon said a vital social function of the university is to foster research that produces new knowledge, and to help ensure that this knowledge influences public policy debate on crucial issues. Here, Sen. Gordon said, Columbia might have a distinct role to play because it has produced some of the key research on climate change.

Sen. Gordon said it is precisely because of the public policy fallout from critiques of the science of climate change on nonscientific grounds that the ACSRI proposes, as a matter of socially responsible investing, a targeted fossil fuel divestment and no-investment policy and other strategies based on a commitment to stand up for science. The committee believes that such an approach responds to the particular role and responsibility of a university in a democratic society, and is quite distinct from other grounds for divestment.

Sen. Gordon said the challenge for the ACSRI for the rest of the current academic year is to find concrete applications for the principle it adopted last spring.

Sen. Gordon said some examples of climate change denialism are sponsoring and putting forth specious research, or trying to overemphasize small differences in the scientific community. The ACSRI calls this approach denying the science *by word*. Or firms can deny climate change science by investing in high-carbon-resource explorations and research-and-development activities--a response the committee calls denying the science *by deed*. Firms that don’t extract fossil fuels but use them might be deemed to be denying the science by deed if they refuse to shift to fuels with lower CO₂ emissions--for example, from coal to gas.

Sen. Gordon said the ACSRI will devise metrics for such climate change denialism this year, with help from University staff as well as outside consultants. The committee may, in concert with other institutions, take a position targeting firms that extract or heavily use coal, another possible application of the Stand Up for Science framework. It may also consider strategies of engagement with firms that it decides not to target for divestment.

Sen. Gordon emphasized that the ACSRI has taken no formal action on fossil-fuel divestment, a complex issue. He repeated that it's a hard-working, serious group that did good work on private prisons and was able to persuade the Trustees. He added there is renewed student energy on this issue. A student group showed up unexpectedly at the first ACSRI meeting to, as he put it, serenade the committee.

Sen. Gordon thought the committee has maintained pretty good relations with the students, relations that he said the president has helped to foster. The president will convene another meeting with students on this subject later in the coming week. Sen. Gordon said the ACSRI will do its thing, and the students will do theirs.

Provost's Advisory Committee on ROTC. Sen. Jeffrey Kysar (Ten., SEAS), the committee chair, said the Naval ROTC program is now running in steady state, with nine students on campus. Three are three women and six men; two are in the School of General Studies and the rest in other undergraduate programs.

Sen. Kysar said there have been commissioning ceremonies in each of the last two years. One graduate, Abigail Wyatt, is now a naval aviator undergoing flight training in Pensacola, Fla. Another, Patrick Poorbaugh, was commissioned last May into the Marines. Both had been enlisted sailors or Marines before coming to Columbia.

May 2016 will mark a milestone, Sen. Kysar said--the first commissioning of a student who started here as a freshman after ROTC's reinstatement at Columbia in 2011. Another cycle will be completed when the Naval and Marine officers who administer the ROTC program at Columbia for two or three years cycle through. All of the original officers have now cycled through, the normal turnover pattern for ROTC units.

ROTC has also contributed to Columbia's larger mission in other ways, Sen. Kysar said. Last year when Sen. Ian Lipkin identified a number of critical technology needs for health care workers in West Africa fighting the Ebola crisis, ROTC director Captain Mark Scovill was able to offer useful advice, based on his extensive experience in relief operations around the world.

Adjournment. Sen. O'Halloran adjourned the meeting at around 2:40 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Tom Mathewson, Senate staff